Etienne Aubry, *The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship*, 1773 or 1775

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Etienne Aubry, French, 1745–1781</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td><em>The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Object Date</td>
<td>1773 or 1775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate and Variant Titles</td>
<td><em>Deux Époux, allant voir un de leurs enfants en nourrice, font embrasser le petit nourriçon par son frère aîné; La première leçon d’amitié fraternelle; Visite à la nourrice</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>Oil on canvas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dimensions (Unframed)</td>
<td>31 1/4 x 38 1/2 in. (79.4 x 97.8 cm)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signature</td>
<td>Signed and dated lower right: E. aubry, 177[5 or 3]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

doi: 10.37764/78973.5.302

**Catalogue Entry**

**Citation**

**Chicago:**


**MLA:**


Etienne Aubry was one of the more accomplished genre painters who emerged at the Paris Salons in the 1770s, filling the void left by Jean-Baptiste Greuze (1725–1805), who had withdrawn from publicly exhibiting his work during that decade, and by Jean Siméon Chardin (1699–1779), who had turned his focus back to painting still lifes. Aubry first came to notice as a portraitist, the category in which he was accepted by the Royal Academy of Painting and Sculpture in 1771, but he aspired to be a painter of multigigure pictures. He achieved this first, and most successfully, with scenes of daily life, but he later turned to historical subjects. In 1777, at the urging of the comte d’Angiviller (1730–1810)—the influential *directeur des bâtiments* (in effect, the minister of culture) and one of Aubry’s principal patrons—he traveled to Italy, but his attempts at history painting met with little enthusiasm. He died in Paris soon after his return from Rome, at the age of thirty-six.

Florence Ingersoll-Smous, in her foundational article on Aubry published in 1925, considered *The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship* to be “one of the most ambitious genre paintings painted by Aubry.”¹ He first exhibited it at the Paris Salon of 1777 with the description, “Two
spouses, going to see one of their children at the wet nurse’s, encourage his older brother to embrace the little nursemother. The rustic interior, with its rough stone floor and bare wall devoid of decoration, suggests the humble circumstances of the young nursemother, who sits to the left of center, holding her young charge in her lap. The infant leans toward his older brother, who stands on the tips of his toes as he reaches up to kiss his sibling. He is encouraged by his mother, who gently presses him forward. His father, seated comfortably at the left, gazes upon this touching scene, as do two figures standing at the right: a younger man—probably the nursemother’s husband—and a kindly older woman, who leans on the back of a chair. Aubry orchestrated the picture with considerable skill, arranging his figures with care and employing an array of eloquent gestures and expressions to convey the nuances of his little drama, techniques inspired by the works of Greuze. At his death, Aubry was recognized for bringing a level of sophistication to these pictures of daily life, which he succeeded in making interesting by the pathos of his scenes, the moving predicaments of his actors, and virtuous subjects . . . and by a pleasing contrast of passions, feelings, and characters.

Unlike Greuze, Aubry, as one art critic wrote in 1777, “has the merit of often bringing together in his pictures city folk with those from the countryside.” In The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship, he distinguished between the aristocratic parents and their rural counterparts—what the artist’s viewers would have recognized as representing the Second Estate and the Third Estate, respectively—through specificities of clothing, facial and body types, and poses and gestures. These distinctions allowed viewers to appreciate the class dynamics in play, enhancing the underlying conflict enacted before their eyes. The infant’s birth parents have come, it is clear, from an entirely different world: the well-to-do father, seated at left, is dressed at the height of fashion in a red velvet coat trimmed in gold, knee breeches (culottes), and a tricorne hat displayed jauntily on his head, his long hair pulled back by a blue ribbon. He appears at ease, gazing with some amusement at his children’s encounter. His wife, wearing a magnificent white satin dress that swirls around her in billowing folds, with her hair pulled up in elaborate curls, leans toward her sons with a slightly anxious look crossing her face. This elegant couple anchors the composition, filling the modest surroundings with confidence and casual authority. By contrast, the rustic pair observing the scene at the right expresses in their poses and slight remove a deference befitting their social standing, even as their kindly expressions suggest the emotional bonds they have developed for their young charge.

At the center of the scene, Aubry placed the nursemother herself, holding the little boy out to receive his brother’s embrace. Unlike the sour nurses in Greuze’s The Nursemother, this young woman appears healthy and maternal, well suited for her job. She embodies contemporaneous notions of the ideal wet nurse, as described in 1765 in the Encyclopédie (a general encyclopedia published in France between 1751 and 1772): “The qualifications of a good wet nurse are usually considered to be her age, the amount of time since she has given birth, her physical condition, especially that of her breasts, the quality of her milk, and, finally, her morals.” Aubry shows her in simple clothes, wearing a modest bonnet, and with one breast and nipple exposed, in pointed contrast to the elaborately draped and coiffed mother; the nursemother represents “nature” rather than the world of “culture” signified by the high-born husband and wife. This dichotomy is also conveyed by the two brothers—one sporting an elegant white suit and black chapeau; the other nearly naked—and by the visual rhyme between the father’s walking stick and the long handle of the copper pot at the lower right. The latter forms part of a beautifully realized group of onions, cabbages, and cooking utensils; they are drawn straight from the repertoire of Chardin, another key influence on Aubry’s art. This still life in the corner of the painting suggests a well-stocked larder and the simple, healthy country diet of the nursemother and her family.

The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship was only one of several genre scenes Aubry submitted to the Salon of 1777 (he also exhibited a Portrait of an Artist and numerous small pictures that have not been identified). It may have been painted several years earlier—the last numeral of the date on the Nelson-Atkins’ picture appears to be a “3” or a “5” rather than the “6” that is often assumed. It was not unusual at the time for artists to exhibit works made at an earlier date. At the Salon, the few critics who mentioned Aubry were generally admiring of his large family drama The Interrupted Wedding (private collection) but more critical of his other works. One of them wrote, “M. Aubry makes scenes of daily life; there is a certain merit in his works, but he is far too mannered . . . ; all in all, he would do better to devote himself to portraiture.” The Nelson-Atkins painting received mixed reviews: one writer thought that “its vigor, its execution, and its expression are all admirable,” while another complained of its “badly painted” colors that were “laid on too thick.” The subject seems to have particularly disturbed the

The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art I French Paintings and Pastels, 1600–1945
latter critic: “I will say nothing about it, because attitudes that give rise to a practice so contrary to nature as that of entrusting one’s children to a hired woman must not be very natural and, consequently, cannot touch the heart of a rational man.”12 This was becoming a common refrain among reform-minded thinkers during these years, who condemned wet nursing in lieu of mothers breastfeeding their own children.13 The writer in the Encyclopédie, for example, criticized the practice: “Aside from the usual rapport between the child and the mother, the latter is much more likely to take tender care of her child than a hired woman who is only motivated by the salary she receives, which is often very modest. One must conclude that a child’s mother, even if she is not as good a wet nurse, is still preferable to a stranger.”14

Whether Aubry himself intended his picture as a pointed critique of the practice of wet nursing is difficult to say. The critic cited above apparently objected to what he understood as Aubry’s neutral representation of an “unnatural” practice. This seems also to be the case with another picture on the theme of nursing by Aubry, Farewell to the Nurse (Fig. 1), also shown at the Salon of 1777. The well-heeled parents have come to the country to pick up their child from the nursemaid; the child appears to resist being taken from the nurse, the only mother he has known. While the protagonists are similar to those in the Kansas City painting, and the pictures could almost be considered different episodes in the life of the same family, the paintings are not true pendants, as has sometimes been claimed; they are of very different sizes and were not sold together.15 No doubt visitors to the Salon could have appreciated the emotional dimensions of what must have been a familiar experience, but again, as Emma Barker has argued, the painting seems to have been understood as a “perfectly straightforward depiction of current child-rearing practice” rather than a condemnation.16 Nor can we be sure that the central focus on the two brothers’ embrace had any allegorical or political meaning, as has sometimes been claimed. The title by which the Kansas City picture is commonly known derives from an engraving after Aubry’s painting, made by Nicolas Delaunay (1739–1792), which carried the title Première leçon d’amitié fraternelle (Fig. 2) and was not published until 1787, well after Aubry’s death.17

At that time the picture was owned by Jacques Augustin de Silvestre (1719–1809), a well-known painter-engraver who was in fact one of Aubry’s first teachers (and who had been drawing master to the royal children of King Louis XV). Silvestre’s celebrated picture collection—which he made available to artists and amateurs—had a long pedigree, having been started by his great-grandfather, the engraver Israël Silvestre (1621–1691). It included numerous Old Masters, inherited from his forebears, as well as works by contemporary artists that Jacques Augustin himself had acquired, including two paintings by Greuze and no fewer than fifteen by

The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art I French Paintings and Pastels, 1600–1945
Chardin, artists much admired by Aubry. As for works by Aubry, besides The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship, Silvestre owned numerous drawings as well as Coriolanus Taking Leave of his Wife to Join the Volscians in their Attack upon Rome (ca. 1780; Mount Holyoke College Art Museum, South Hadley, MA), Aubry’s last painting and an attempt at historical painting after he returned from his trip to Rome. The Nelson-Atkins painting remained in Silvestre’s possession until his death, a testament to the importance he placed on it.

Richard Rand
July 2018

Notes


5. As pointed out in Fossey, “Étienne Aubry, Peintre du Roi,” 480.


9. “M. Aubry fera donc le genre familier: il y a quelque mérite dans ses productions; mais il est beaucoup trop maniére . . . ; au surplus, il fera mieux de se livrer au portrait”; La Prêtresse, ou Nouvelle Manière de Prédire ce qui est arrivé (Rome: les Marchands de Nouveautés, 1777), 17, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Collection Deloyes, vol. 10, no. 189, p. 17.


15. See, for example, Fossey, “Étienne Aubry, Peintre du Roi,” 480.


17. “All are united in the warmth of this charming moment of the first filial embrace, which serves as a metaphor for the idea of universal brotherhood which flourished in this period”; Eric M. Zafran, *The Rococo Age: French Masterpieces of the Eighteenth Century*, exh. cat. (Atlanta: High Museum of Art, 1983), 119. See also Barker, *Greuze and the Painting of Sentiment*, 192, with the fair point that such meaning could have been posthumously applied to the engraving: “Some such didactic and even symbolic significance seems to underlie the title that Aubry’s composition acquired when the print after it [sic] appeared in 1787.”

18. “Notice sur Jacques-Augustin de Silvestre,” in François Léandre Regnault-Delalande, *Catalogue Raisonné d’Objets d’Arts du Cabinet de Feu M. de Silvestre, ci-devant Chevalier de l’Ordre de Saint-Michel, et Maitre à Dessiner des Enfans de France* (Paris: [François Léandre Regnault-Delalande], 1810), i–viii. The works by Aubry are catalogued under nos. 1 (*Coriolanus*), 2 (*First Lesson*), and 166–72 (drawings). The title given for the Kansas City painting, *Les Adieux d’un villageois et de sa femme au nourrisson que le père et la mère leur retirent*, has caused confusion with the Williamstown *Farewell to the Wet Nurse* (Fig. 1), but the dimensions recorded (29.6 x 39 pouces [inches]) match the Kansas City painting, and the painting is described as the one engraved by Delaunay under the title *La première Leçon d’Amitié fraternelle*.

---

**Technical Entry**

Technical entry forthcoming.

---

**Documentation**

**Citation**

**Chicago:**


**MLA:**


**Provenance**

Jacques Augustin de Silvestre (1719–1809), Paris, by 1787–1811;


Évrard Charlemagne Rhoné (Valenciennes, 1782–Paris, 1861), by May 7, 1861 [2];

Purchased from Rhoné’s posthumous sale, *La Belle et Riche Collection de Tableaux Anciens et Modernes, des Ecoles Flamande, Hollandoise et Françoise, Formant la Galerie de feu M. Évrard Rhoné, à Paris, 3 rue Drouot*, Hôtel des Commissaires-Priseurs, Paris, May 7, 1861, no. 74, as *Visite à la Nourrice*, by Symphorien Casimir Joseph
Boittelle (1813/1816–1897), May 7, 1861–April 25, 1866 [3];

Boittelle’s sale, *Tableaux de l’Ecole Française composant la Collection de M. Boittelle, Sénateur, Ancien Préfet de Police*, Hôtel Drouot, Paris, April 24–25, 1866, no. 1, as *La Première Leçon d’Amitié fraternelle*;

Georges Wildenstein (1892–1963), Paris, by 1925;

Presumably sold by Wildenstein to his brother-in-law, Louis Isaac Paraf (b. 1871), Paris, by March 20, 1928–April 1929 [4];

Purchased from Paraf by D. A. Hoogendijk and Co., Amsterdam, stock number O. S. 855, as *La première leçon d’amitié fraternelle*, April 1929–December 27, 1932 [5];


**Notes**

[1] The dimensions given in the catalogue entry—“H. 29 p. 61., L. 37 p.”—are much closer to the Nelson-Atkins painting than to those of the same title by Etienne Aubry at the Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute, Williamstown, MA, and The Pushkin State Museum of Fine Arts, Moscow. Further confirming this reference to NAMA’s painting is the inclusion in the lot description of an engraved reproduction of the painting by Nicolas De launay titled *La première Leçon d’Amitié fraternelle*, which was made after the Kansas City painting. See also Florence Ingersoll-Smith, “Quelques Tableaux de Genre Inédits par Étienne Aubry (1745–1781),” *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* 2, no. 5 (1925): 82.

[2] [Alban Jules] Lambert, “*Inventaire d’après décès de M. Rhoné,*” April 26, 1861, Archives nationales, Paris, Minutier central des notaires de Paris, étude CXII, cote 2094, folio 9, no. 155, as *La Visite à la nourrice* [photocopy in The Getty Research Institute, Los Angeles, Collectors Files, Evard Charlemagne Rhoné].

[3] This collector has been listed as Symphorien Casimir Joseph Boittelle and alternately as Edouard Charles Joseph Boittelle.


**Related Works**

Etienne Aubry, *Les adieux à la nourrice (Farewell to the Nurse)*, ca. 1776–1777, oil on canvas, 20 7/16 x 24 3/4 in. (51.9 x 62.8 cm), Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute, Williamstown, MA.

Etienne Aubry, *Parting with a Wet Nurse*, 1777, oil on canvas, 20 1/2 x 24 13/16 in. (52 x 63 cm), The Pushkin State Museum of Fine Arts, Moscow.

**Reproductions**

Nicolas De launay, after Etienne Aubry, *Première leçon d’amitié fraternelle*, 1787, engraving, 18 13/16 x 24 1/2 in. (47.8 x 62.2 cm), first proof image only, second proof image and colophon, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris.

**Preparatory Works**


**Known Copies**

Attributed to Etienne Aubry, *The Visit* (also called *La Visite à la Nourrice et La Première Leçon d’Amitié Fraternelle*), copy in reverse, oil on canvas, 19 x 24 1/2 in. (48 x 62 cm), location unknown, illustrated in *Objets d’Art Anciens des XVIe, XVIIe et XVIIIe siècles provenant pour la plupart de l’ancienne Collection du Baron Carl Mayer de Rothschild et appartenant à Madame de X….* (Paris: Galerie Charpentier, March 30, 1935), no. 82.

Attributed to Etienne Aubry, *La visite à la nourrice (The Visit to the Nurse)*, copy in reverse, oil on canvas, 24 x 27 15/16 in. (61 x 71 cm), location unknown, illustrated in *Importants Tableaux Anciens des XVIe, XVIIe, XVIIIe et XIXe Siècles notamment par: Constantin Guys, J.-B. Huet, Nicolas...*
Exhibition of Figure Paintings, University of Iowa, Iowa City, November 5–30, 1936, no. 1, as The Visit.

Pictures of Everyday Life: Genre Painting in Europe, 1500–1900, Carnegie Institute, Department of Fine Arts, Pittsburgh, October 14–December 12, 1954, no. 67, as The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship.


Homage to Mozart: A Loan Exhibition of European Painting, 1750–1800, Honoring the 200th Anniversary of Mozart’s Birth, Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, CT, March 22–April 29, 1956, no. 1, as The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship.


The Rococo Age: French Masterpieces of the Eighteenth Century, High Museum of Art, Atlanta, October 5–December 31, 1983, no. 54, as The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship.


References


Pierre Samuel Du Pont de Nemours, “Lettre à la margrave Caroline-Louise de Bade,” [October 24, 1777], Les Trois Salons de 1773, 1777 et 1779: Lettres à Son Altesse Séréniissime Madame la Margrave Régnante de Bade, Manuscript Accession 84, P. S. du Pont de Nemours...

Catalogue des Tableaux de l'École Française composant la Collection de M. Boitelle, Sénateur, Ancien Préfet de Police (Paris: Hôtel Drouot, 1866), IV-V, 1.


Adolphe Siret, Dictionnaire historique et raisonné des peintres de toutes les écoles depuis l'origine de la peinture jusqu'à nos jours, 3rd ed. (Brussels: Chez les Principaux Libraires, 1883), 1:42, as première leçon d'amitié fraternelle.

H. Hombron, Catalogue des Tableaux, Dessins et Gravures exposés dans les galeries du Musée de la Ville de Brest (Brest: L. Évian-Roger, 1891), 9.


Louis Hautecœur, “Le Sentimentalisme dans la Peinture Française de Greuze à David (Deuxième et Dernier
Article),” Gazette des Beaux-Arts 1, no. 621 (March 1909): 276, as La Première leçon de l'amitié fraternelle.


Louis Réau, Histoire de la Peinture Française au XVIIIe siècle (Paris: G. van Oest, 1926), 2:57, as La Première leçon d'amitié fraternelle.


François Boucher, “Une Exposition au Musée Carnavalet: La Vie Parisienne au XVIIIe Siècle,” Le Gaulois Artistique 2, no. 19 (April 7, 1928): 165, as Visite à la nourrice.

La Vie Parisienne au XVIIIe Siècle: Conférences du Musée Carnavalet (1928) (Paris: Payot, 1928), (repro.), as La Visite à la nourrice.


Catalogus van de Tentoonstelling van Oude Kunst door de Vereeniging van Handelaren in Oude Kunst in Nederland, exh. cat. (Amsterdam: H. J. Koersen, 1929), 1, (repro.).


Tentoonstelling van Oude Schilderijen, Rotterdamsche Kunstkring, exh. cat. (Amsterdam: D. A. Hoogendijk, 1929), 5, (repro.).


Oude Schilderijen: Catalogus van eenige schilderijen en een beeldhouwwerk door de firma D. A. Hoogendijk en Co. te Amsterdam afgestaan voor de tentoonstelling, die de “Vereeniging van Handelaren in Oude Kunst in Nederland” gedurende de maanden juli en augustus 1929, in het Rijksmuseum te Amsterdam zal Houden (Amsterdam: D. A. Hoogendijk, [1929]), unpaginated, (repro.), as La Première Leçon d’Amitié Fraternelle.

Karl T. Parker, “Etienne Aubry (1745-1781): Study of a Standing Male Figure,” Old Master Drawings 5, no. 18 (September 1930): 38, as La Première Leçon d’Amitié Fraternelle.


Kansas City Star 53, no. 113 (January 8, 1933): 4, (repro.), as A French Cottage Interior.

“Nelson Gallery of Art Special Number,” Art Digest 8, no. 5 (December 1, 1933): 21, 25, (repro.), as Interior Scene.


Luigi Vaiani, “Art Dream Becomes Reality with Official Gallery Opening at Hand: Critic Views Wide Collection of Beauty as Public Prepares to Pay Its First Visit to


*Exhibition of Figure Paintings*, exh. cat. ([Iowa City]: University of Iowa, 1936), unpaginated.


*Pictures of Everyday Life: Genre Painting in Europe, 1500–1900*, exh. cat. (Pittsburgh: Carnegie Institute, Department of Fine Arts, 1954), (repro.).


Elizabeth LaMotte Cates Milroy, “Keeping Abreast of Etienne Aubry” (master’s thesis, Williams College, 1979), 6, 12, 20, viii, (repro.).


*Important Old Master Drawings: The Properties of The Bernasconi Family and from various sources* (London: Christie, Manson and Woods, December 8, 1987), 97, as *The First Lesson of Fraternal Friendship*.


Patricia R. Ivinski et al., *Farewell to the Wet Nurse: Etienne Aubry and Images of Breast-Feeding in Eighteenth-Century France*, exh. cat. (Williamstown, MA: Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute, 1998), 8–9, 12, 14, 17n4, 21, 41, (repro.).

*MMI, exh. cat.* (London: Hall and Knight, 2001), 156, as *La Première Leçon d'Amitié Fraternelle*.


Ryan Lee Whyte, “Painting as Social Conversation: The petit sujet in the Ancien Régime” (PhD diss., University of Toronto (Canada), 2008), 185, 320, (repro.).
